

B Most Creative Ideas

Panel A. Manager Evaluators and \$100 x 1

Usefulness	Score	
1	70.6	Another idea is that of a mini-contest. Although I have never won a contest on M'turk, I do believe my fellow participants like having a chance at winning a prize (that is part of the reason why we are here). If a participant passes the attention checks, not only are they able to continue with the survey, but they are also qualified to win a prize, with most participants getting a bonus of some sort. Participants love bonuses, no matter what these bonuses may be.
2	68.7	Requester might try attaching a small attention bonus. On a page where a worker needs to be attentive, they can have a word flash on the screen for a couple of seconds. If the worker records the word, they get a little extra monetary compensation added on to the base survey payment. Maybe there could be 3 or 4 so the worker never knows when it's coming. If they catch all of them, then maybe there could be a slightly larger bonus. Maybe the words could form a phrase that the worker has to enter at the end to unlock the bonus.
3	68.1	How about a sentence that you would be asked to take the first letter from each word to spell a day of the week. For instance Frank ran in David's alley yesterday, that would be FRIDAY.
Novelty	Score	
1	77.6	Intergalactic Explorer—The participant chooses an avatar and enters a spaceship; they direct their spaceship from galaxy to galaxy, picking up lifeforms, relevant space objects, etc., that are needed at their home planet. The objects/lifeforms they pick up may be associated/labelled with items/facts they have read in the survey up to that point. Also, on their journey, when they find a necessary object and thus demonstrate comprehension, they are given a clue to find a special mystery treasure in that galaxy. If they find it, they receive a small bonus. By the end of the journey, the turker should have collected a prescribed amount of objects/correct answers to pre-given questions. At that point, they can return home, count of their treasure, and continue with the survey.
2	76.5	Using the scene from the Wizard of Oz, where the trees hurl their apples at the travelers (as they cry "how bout dem apples"), a scary tree throws apples at the worker's avatar, which is perhaps a character from the famous movie or one chosen by the worker. The apples are labelled with facts, ideas, answers from the survey up to that point, as well as false items. The worker must evade the 'false' apples and catch the apples with the correct items. If they are successful, they move on down the yellow brick road. If not, the flying monkeys come and carry them away.
3	76.4	'The M-Turker 500' – The survey taker chooses from a selection or is given a race car. They will race against a number of other computer cars. The challenge is that their car slows down successively during the race if they do not answer comprehension questions accurately and in a timely manner. On the other hand, the quicker they answer questions more accurately, the quicker their car goes. Also, their car may also blow a gasket, get a flat tire, or run out of fuel at random. These calamities can only be fixed by responding to comprehension-related questions when they flash across the screen as quickly as possible. The race lasts for a prescribed amount of time, say 4 min. (unless the racer gains time through quick, accurate answers and finishes before that time). If the racer finishes and wins before the 4-minute mark, they get a bonus. If they are in the lead but do not finish the laps at the end of 4 min., they get a smaller bonus. If they get second place, they can continue with the survey. Third or lower and they may be dropped or have to redo earlier sections of the survey.
Creativity	Score	

1	71.0	Intergalactic Explorer – The participant chooses an avatar and enters a spaceship; they direct their spaceship from galaxy to galaxy, picking up lifeforms, relevant space objects, etc., that are needed at their home planet. The objects/lifeforms they pick up may be associated/labelled with items/facts they have read in the survey up to that point. Also, on their journey, when they find a necessary object and thus demonstrate comprehension, they are given a clue to find a special mystery treasure in that galaxy. If they find it, they receive a small bonus. By the end of the journey, the turker should have collected a prescribed amount of objects/correct answers to pre-given questions. At that point, they can return home, count their treasure, and continue with the survey.
2	70.7	Have mTurkers do a flower arranging task. Invite them to follow specific directions for arranging a bouquet of flowers. To the side is a box with a variety of flowers, in the middle a vase. By clicking an dragging, they must choose the correct flower and place each one in the correct position in the vase. The benefit of this there is nothing tricky about it, it is straight forward, but it has some aesthetic appeal (especially to those who like flowers) if the images of the flowers and vase are appealing enough.
3	70.3	How about a sentence that you would be asked to take the first letter form each word to spell a day of the week. For instance Frank ran in David's alley yesterday, that would be FRIDAY.

Panel B. Manager Evaluators & \$10×10

Usefulness	Score	
1	71.1	Rather than using attention checks as a rejection threat, turn them into a challenge. Add five checks throughout the survey, and inform turkers that if they can find them and correctly answer them, they will receive a bonus. This way people will pay a lot more attention to the survey because they will be carefully looking for the checks. This method works much better than the threat of rejection, and people will work much more carefully.
2	70.3	Easy, use a CAPTCHA but tell them to get it wrong. It's something that people who are on autopilot absolutely won't catch, but anyone paying the slightest bit of attention will catch.
3	68.6	Have the last page of the survey display 10 questions and ask the participant to identify which of the questions had been asked, and what their answer was. Give a bonus for each right answer.
Novelty	Score	
1	75.3	I would add a little turtle traveling across the bottom. He arrives at different places (school, gas station, post office) as the survey progresses. The attention check could be to describe where the turtle is on his journey.
2	72.4	Easy, use a CAPTCHA but tell them to get it wrong. It's something that people who are on autopilot absolutely won't catch, but anyone paying the slightest bit of attention will catch.
3	71.2	Here's another idea—the #1 pet peeve most MTurkers would agree on is the fact that many requesters forget to (or intentionally don't) provide completion codes... set up your attention checks so that they give the M'Turk worker a segment of the code as they go. Not only does it reward attention, it also assures that the survey is not a scam...
Creativity	Score	
1	72.3	I would add a little turtle traveling across the bottom. He arrives at different places (school, gas station, post office) as the survey progresses. The attention check could be to describe where the turtle is on his journey.
2	66.5	Easy, use a CAPTCHA but tell them to get it wrong. It's something that people who are on autopilot absolutely won't catch, but anyone paying the slightest bit of attention will catch.

- 3 65.6 Have a little treasure chest picture (or money bag) on the survey that is interactive. When there are things that need to be paid attention to, the picture could glow or be highlighted, or some other way to see that it needs to be clicked on. By clicking on it the person will be asked a couple of comprehension questions, which will result in a small bonus for every question they get right. By seeing the treasure chest/money bag even if it's not active, people would probably be more engaged since there's an obvious additional reward if they are attentive.

Panel C. Peer Evaluators & \$100×1

Usefulness	Score	
1	76.2	Most of the attention checks are dull and unoriginal; others are so tricky that they defeat the whole purpose of an attention check which is to make sure people are paying attention; not to trick them. My idea is to put in simple arithmetic questions; questions that any 3rd grader could answer but that are not tricky. For example: fill in the blank: 1, 3, (?), 7, 9. This requires attention but is easy. Obviously the answer is 5.
2	73.4	I think that it works well when questions are thrown in the mix that have nothing to do with the survey but occur on the same page as valid questions. Often, surveys have a scale of Totally Disagree (for instance) all the way to Totally Agree. Statements like...“I have been mortally wounded by a bear,” should only merit a Totally Disagree answer. Anything other than that needs to be thrown out. Entire pages that are dedicated to an attention check are not optimal. If there is a random page with a multiple choice of colors, you know the question is an attention check and often no additional checks occur after that. The checks need to be sprinkled throughout.
3	69.4	At the beginning of a survey, mention a secret code word or number hidden somewhere in the survey that must be entered at some point during the experiment. The secret code could be placed in text that workers have to read, ensuring instructions or scenarios are read thoroughly to obtain the secret word. It doesn't have to be anything difficult, something easily remembered mentally. Make it known that the attention check could pop up at any moment and in order to proceed with the HIT and have work approved, you must answer correctly with the code word provided. I feel like workers that are actually paying attention would be motivated and anticipate the attention check. We'd be more apt to read through everything on the screen to find the code instead of the standard long paragraph that we usually get that says, "In order to demonstrate you read the instructions...click this and type this."
Novelty	Score	
1	75.4	Alchemy. A chart will show various combinations of colored liquids and the alchemical result of the mix. Below the chart, there will be 5 empty vials. Each click on a vial will change its color to the next option. Using the chart you must find the correct combination of liquids which is called for such as green green red blue purple. The vials must be changed to match this in order to proceed.
2	73.2	Color in the black cat to proceed. Cat is divided into segments. Multiple color options will be available but the correct one that should be used is black for every segment.

- 3 72.2 For this idea take a picture of magazine that represents the survey the worker is working on with all kinds of articles or pictures in it. Once the worker gets to this part of the survey where they have either lost interest or not paying attention is magazine will appear on the screen. As the worker either clicks the enter button or space bar the magazine will flip between pages. It will either read about make-up blog, vacation home, food craving, new products that are coming, etc. It will last for about five minutes or depending on how long the survey is. When they get to the end of it a roller coaster will pop up with a sweet smiling panda that says, "HAHA you're IT." Then the panda will start dancing to music as he or she slowly drifts away from the screen. The worker will get an arrow to proceed because they actually pay attention within the time frame prohibited or an exit sign to not return the survey.

Creativity	Score	
1	67.7	Alchemy. A chart will show various combinations of colored liquids and the alchemical result of the mix. Below the chart, there will be 5 empty vials. Each click on a vial will change its color to the next option. Using the chart you must find the correct combination of liquids which is called for such as green green red blue purple. The vials must be changed to match this in order to proceed.
2	67.4	An attention check should be straightforward and not sneaky. If you try to do something too tricky, people will be upset. A fun and easy to do attention check would be to present a cartoon with no writing and have people create a caption for it. Making people be creative would help them to better focus on the rest of your survey while being fun at the same time.
3	66.4	This idea is regarding the character Garfield. Garfield is flying an airplane in this video with one hand on the wheel and with the other hand with thumbs up. He is flying a blue airplane with the letters written in red and white that reads flight 47. He also has sunglasses and of course a black helmet with a white scarf wrapped around his neck. There is a hot pink flyer at the end of the airplane reading in bold yellow letters, "Will be back shortly as survey turns." For every worker that either is not paying attention this can pop up as they get to the point of the survey in which it flash across the screen to catch their attention.

Panel D. Peer Evaluators & \$10×10

Usefulness	Score	
1	68.1	Have them pick out the odd thing out in an image of four things—which one of these things is not like the others? As an example, show a chocolate chip cookie, a slice of cake, an ice cream cone, and portion of kale.
2	67.5	I think the best way to ensure that m'turkers pay attention is to provide questions that the users have to actually read, but are absurd and only have one correct answer. For instance, I enjoy riding buffalos in the morning. If included in the survey they aren't easy to spot unless you are actually reading the question and have a clear answer. Some other examples of possible questions: Riding dinosaurs is a hobby I enjoy (answer is true or false) or I have gills and swim in the ocean (answer yes or no).

3	66.6	To gain interest make it fun, use trivia questions as attention checks, when the Turker gets it right they get a nickel/dime...whatever, even a couple of pennies. BUT embed the questions in with your scales/etc. make sure they have to read them, like "I feel depressed often, the first US president was Washington, agree, disagree, etc. Make the total amount of it something like \$0.50 or \$0.75 but put in TITLE...ALL CAPS OR big font, Fun Trivia quiz, win \$2.00 in bonus...or whatever. Turkers love Trivia stuff, they also love things that can be sort of a game or easter egg hunt, it makes it interesting and it will be to the turkers' GREAT advantage to pay attention. Warning though, make each page timed in some way so they can't really look things up but DON'T make it so tough that they can't figure it out. Maybe make it a history or geography theme? You pick, even classic TV or Academy award winning movies, have fun with it.
Novelty	Score	
1	68.0	An interesting attention check would be to have the worker properly complete a mad lib. It seems like it would be easy enough to code depending on the variations in input desired.
2	67.1	Play a flash game of Pong as an attention check against a less than average AI. If you beat the AI, not only do you pass the attention check, you also receive a good bonus such as a dollar. 90 percent of the reason people don't pass attention checks is because the typical pay for the study is ludicrous. 12/hour should be standard.
3	66.7	The attention check should be a picture of an acrostic poem, which is the kind of poem where the first letter of every sentence/phrase/word forms a different word. The attention check should be a text box where someone has to identify the word that forms the basis of the acrostic poem.
Creativity	Score	
1	66.1	Create a game or detective game within the survey. Leave clues throughout that are in bold or the reader has to find themselves. These clues will stand out because they have nothing to do with the survey and they would know it was a clue for that reason and would have to write it down. In the end they would have to provide the answer or list all clues and come up with an answer to all the clues. Keep it fun and if they don't get the answer right it would be ok and not get rejected because they had all the clues and that would be the main thing to make sure they were paying attention. The person that gets the answer correct should get an extra bonus of your discretion. Make sure to leave extra time for the hit because some will take longer than others.
2	65.2	Have the participant choose a word that does NOT follow a common grammar rule (Which of the following does not follow the rule 'i before e except after c'? 1. Receipt, 2. Deceive, 3. Weird, 4. Tier)
3	64.1	The attention check should be a picture of an acrostic poem, which is the kind of poem where the first letter of every sentence/phrase/word forms a different word. The attention check should be a text box where someone has to identify the word that forms the basis of the acrostic poem.

Table A.1. Robustness of Effects on Idea Quality across Score Aggregation Approaches

Panel A. Novelty of the Idea					
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)
Multiple-Prize	-3.978*** (1.211)	-3.732*** (1.033)	-3.558*** (1.246)	-3.830*** (1.054)	-3.732*** (1.033)
Peer Evaluators	-0.525 (1.211)	-1.307 (1.025)	-1.110 (1.254)	-1.381 (1.045)	-1.307 (1.025)
<i>Core Evaluators</i>	✓				
<i>All Evaluators</i>		✓			
<i>Manager Evaluators</i>			✓		
<i>Peer Evaluators</i>				✓	
<i>Assigned Evaluators</i>					✓
<i>Demographic Controls</i>	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Observations	527	527	527	527	527

Panel B. Usefulness of the Idea					
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)
Multiple-Prize	-1.126 (1.091)	-1.037 (1.036)	-0.215 (1.109)	-1.326 (1.126)	-1.037 (1.036)
Peer Evaluators	-2.942*** (1.077)	-3.292*** (1.009)	-3.134*** (1.101)	-3.363*** (1.100)	-3.292*** (1.009)
<i>Core Evaluators</i>	✓				
<i>All Evaluators</i>		✓			
<i>Manager Evaluators</i>			✓		
<i>Peer Evaluators</i>				✓	
<i>Assigned Evaluators</i>					✓
<i>Demographic Controls</i>	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Observations	527	527	527	527	527

Panel C. Creativity of the Idea					
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)
Multiple-Prize	-3.483*** (1.147)	-3.523*** (1.008)	-2.607** (1.160)	-3.882*** (1.056)	-3.523*** (1.008)
Peer Evaluators	-1.189 (1.146)	-1.662* (0.994)	-1.802 (1.167)	-1.604 (1.042)	-1.662* (0.994)
<i>Core Evaluators</i>	✓				
<i>All Evaluators</i>		✓			
<i>Manager Evaluators</i>			✓		
<i>Peer Evaluators</i>				✓	
<i>Assigned Evaluators</i>					✓
<i>Demographic Controls</i>	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Observations	527	527	527	527	527

Notes: The specifications in this table mirror those in column (3) of table 5, with column (1) being an exact replication, but with different score aggregation approaches for the dependent variables. Regression specifications include a constant, but we do not report the constant for brevity. Robust standard errors are reported in parentheses. The symbols *, **, and *** denote statistical significance at the 10 percent, 5 percent, and 1 percent levels, respectively, from one-tailed tests when testing a hypothesis and two-tailed tests otherwise.